

# JUDICIAL EVALUATION COMMISSION MINUTES

NOVEMBER 8, 1999  
HOLIDAY INN SELECT, ELM HILL PIKE

## Roll Call

A public meeting of the Judicial Evaluation Commission was conducted at the Holiday Inn Select on Elm Hill Pike in Nashville on November 8, 1999.

Commission members present included: Steve Daniel, Sarah Sheppard, Barbara Walls, Stanley Rogers, Irvin Kilcrease, Quincy Barlow, Cynthia Bond, Jeff Devasher, Sharon Bell, Robert Radford, Barbara Haskew, and D'Army Harlan Goan and Stephanie Caldwell of the AOC were also present.

## Introductions

Two new Commission member, Cynthia Bond and Irwin Kilcrease, were introduced and sworn-in by Connie Clark, Administrative Director of the Courts. Both new members were appointed by the Judicial Council to replace vacancies created by resignations from Connie Clark and Pat Murrell.

## Explanation of Reports

Commission members previously received copies of the survey results for Judges Cottrell, Ogle, and Williams. Judges Swiney and Glenn had no survey results because they had been in office less than one year.

Harlan explained the layout of the reports and assisted Commission members with the survey results.

## Interviews

The Commission interviewed judges Cottrell, Glenn, Ogle, Swiney, and Williams. Each interview lasted approximately forty-five (45) minutes. Commission members discussed survey results, if available, pending caseload, qualifications and talked to each judge about his/her work.

ACTION TAKEN: After a series of motions, the Commission revised the interview section of Judge Ogle's report to read as follows:

Interview 11/8/99: The interview with Judge Ogle demonstrated that she had broad experience as a practicing attorney in civil matters, less experience in criminal matters and no experience in criminal appeals prior to her appointment. She received a high evaluation from her peers on the appellate courts for general performance and oral argument preparation but received only adequate ratings from attorneys for her written opinions. As a result of remarks made by Judge Ogle during the interview, some members of the commission expressed concerns about her treatment of attorneys and her overall judicial temperament, although attorneys responding to the survey rated her good to excellent in these areas. The commission found Judge Ogle was not current in

JUDICIAL EVALUATION COMMISSION  
MINUTES

writing opinions assigned to her. However, Judge Ogle assured the commission that this deficiency is being resolved.

The Commission also voted to include the date of the interviews in all evaluations.

All business having been concluded, the conference call was terminated about 3:35 p.m.

Prepared by:

Harlan Goan